Requirements for Memory

• I (really) remember X:
  1. I have an experience as though I remember x.
  2. X has to have happened.
  3. My memory of x has been produced in the right way (reliably).

Theories of Personal Identity

• **Same Soul Theory.**
• **Same Body Theory.**
• **Psychological Continuity Theory.**
• Objections?
• Danger of Duplication:
  – Could more than one later person be psychologically continuous with me?
Psychological Continuity

In the Transporter

Person-stages:

Experience x

Memory of x

Experience y

Spock t

Shmock t+1

on the planet

Shmock is psychologically continuous with Spock, so they are the very same person: (Spock = Shmock)

Psychological Continuity

Person-stages:

Experience x

Memory of x

Experience y

Spock t

Shmock t+1

on the planet

Shlock t+1

Shmock is psychologically continuous with Spock, so they are the very same person: (Spock = Shlock)

Psychological Continuity

Person-stages:

Experience x

Memory of x

Spock t

Shmock t+1

Shlock t+1

on the planet

Shlock and Shmock are qualitatively indiscernible, but since they have different bodies they are not numerically identical: (Shmock ≠ Shlock)

Psychological Continuity

• So we have:
• Spock = Shlock
• Spock = Shmock
• By transitivity of identity: Shlock = Shmock
• But, Shlock ≠ Shmock
• Contradiction!
  – Like a xerox machine in which 2 copies are made, and the original is destroyed.
Psychological Continuity

- **Psychological Continuity Theory**: A person at one time is the very same person as a person at a later time if and only if there is one and only one person at the later time who is psychologically continuous with the person at the earlier time.
- Too *ad hoc*?

---

Psychological Continuity

- Fix Contradiction?
- One person cannot become/be identical with two (different) people.
- Add a further condition to the Psychological Continuity Theory:

---

Psychological Continuity

- Too *ad hoc*?
- You could never know if you were the very same person, for fear of an unknown double running around.
- When you wake up in the morning, you know it’s you, without knowing whether you’ve been duplicated.
- Perhaps you *are* the duplicate--you just think you are the original!

---

Psychological Continuity

- If one of the later person-stages has a *better* claim to being identical to the original, then that person is the very same person, the other is only a duplicate.
- Like a xerox machine, where the original is preserved, and a copy is made.
- But Shlock can’t tell he’s the duplicate!
- What would you say to Shlock?
Psychological Continuity

• Problem is created because of the transitivity of identity— you can’t become two different people.
• If there are 2 later person-stages that have equal claim to being psychologically continuous with the earlier stage, does that mean the person has gone out of existence?
• But would it be as bad as dying?

Psychological Continuity

• But would it be as bad as dying?
• What do you care about?
• Taking care of those you love?
• Finishing projects you’ve started?
• Those things would still happen.

Psychological Continuity

• Perhaps identity is not what’s important.
• What’s important is that there be a future self who continues my concerns.
• Perhaps what matters is not numerical identity (which has to be unique), but continuation/survival, which does not. (p.49)
• Another modification:

Psychological Continuity

• Psychological Continuity Theory: A person at one time continues/survives as a person at a later time if and only if the person at the later time is psychologically continuous with the person at the earlier time.
• No longer a theory of personal identity.
• But may be what we are really looking for.

Theories of Personal Identity

• Same Soul Theory.
• Same Body Theory.
• Psychological Continuity Theory.
• Could there be conflicts between these theories?
  – The judgement made by one theory differs from the judgement made by another theory about a particular (hard) case.
• Which theory to follow in that case?

Theories of Personal Identity

• Brain-transplant case:
  – Julia North and Mary Frances Beaudine.
• JN about to die from damage to her heart.
• MB about to die from damage to her brain.
• Transplant JN’s brain into MB’s body.
• Who is the resulting person?
Theories of Personal Identity

- Who is the resulting person?
- Same Soul Theory?
- Same Body Theory?
- Psychological Continuity Theory?
- What are the strengths and weaknesses of each of the competing theories?
- What implications do the various theories have for immortality?