The Death of Socrates

Objections to Arguments for Immortality
• Socrates encourages objections (84c, 91c).
• Simmias (85e-86c):
  – Analogy: Soul’s relationship to the body is like a strummed chord’s relationship to a lyre.

Lyre

Objections to Arguments for Immortality
• Simmias (85e-86c):
  – Harmonious chord : physical lyre :: soul : body.
  – Chord is destroyed when lyre is destroyed.
  – ∴ Soul is destroyed when body is destroyed.

Kinds of Arguments
• Deductive arguments: aim for certainty.
  – If premisses are true, conclusion must be true.
• Inductive arguments: aim for probability.
  – If the premisses are true, the conclusion is likely to be true.
• Arguments by analogy are inductive.
• Are the things being compared analogous in relevant respects?

Objections to Arguments for Immortality
• Cebes (87a-88b):
  – Analogy: A person’s relationship to his outfits over time is like a soul’s relationship to its bodies over time.
Objections to Arguments for Immortality

- Cebes (87a-88b):
  - Cloak : Weaver :: Body : Soul
  - Weaver wears out and outlasts many cloaks but eventually dies.
  - ∴ Soul may outlast many bodies yet also eventually dies too. (This body may be its last.)

Emotional Crisis

- Can we trust reason (88c)?
- Socrates’ sensitivity (89a).
- Danger of “misology” (89d-90e).
  - Logos: reason, discourse
- Socrates warns he may not have a “philosophical attitude” just now (91a)!

Socrates’ Replies

- Reply to Simmias:
  - Simmias’ analogy is inconsistent with the Doctrine of Recollection.
  - Simmias accepts Doctrine of Recollection.
  - ∴ Simmias’ must reject his analogy.

Socrates’ Replies

- Another reply to Simmias:
  - Soul influences body.
  - Chord does not influence lyre.
  - ∴ Simmias’ analogy must be rejected.

Socrates’ Replies

- Reply to Cebes:
  - Essential Properties: part of the essence of a thing (part of the thing’s Form)—if it didn’t have that property, it wouldn’t be that (kind of) thing.
  - Accidental Properties: properties that aren’t essential—if it didn’t have that property, it would still be that (kind of) thing.

Who am I?

What are my essential properties?
What are my accidental properties?
# Properties of a Person

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Essential:</strong></th>
<th><strong>Accidental:</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Species?</td>
<td>Height</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Race/Ethnicity?</td>
<td>Weight</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DNA/Parents?</td>
<td>Hair color/length</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender?</td>
<td>Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capacity to think?</td>
<td>Interests?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memories?</td>
<td>Values?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Height
- Weight
- Hair color/length
- Name
- Interests?
- Values?